Ricerca educativa in ambito formale
Educational research in formal field
Does a multimodal narrative workshop enhance motivation in multicultural class?  
A exploratory study in a primary school

Le attività narrative multimodali accrescono la motivazione nelle classi multiculturali?  
Uno studio esplorativo in una scuola primaria

**ABSTRACT**

Today’s teachers face a double challenge: to raise the students’ communicative and narrative skills, while at the same time maintaining a high level of motivation even in the face of the difficulties caused by the use of Italian as L2. In this context, the use of multimodal narrative activities can be effective, allowing everyone to find their own most congenial way of expression. In a class of 8-9 year olds with a high rate of foreign students, we organized a multimodal storytelling workshop based on an adaptation of Shakespeare’s work “The merchant of Venice”. Eighteen children tried their hand at listening, shadow theatre, drawing, confrontation, writing and digital storytelling. At each step, we measured their motivation for storytelling, trying to understand which activities produced the greatest effects. Results show that foreign children start with a lower perception of their narrative skills and perceive a higher effort. However, at the end of the workshop the two groups finished with very close results. Children feel more confident communicating by acting but the set of experienced modalities motivated children to narrate. We have recorded a steady interest by the children, and despite some difficulties, they showed perseverance and determination in the assigned tasks, bringing them to completion.

**KEYWORDS**

Migrant Students; Multiliteracies; Multimodality; Narrative skills; Primary school; Intrinsic Motivation.

Studenti migranti; Multiliteracies; multimodalità; Abilità narrative; Scuola elementare; Motivazione intrinseca.
1. Introduction

The theme of international migration is a current and crucial issue in various European and international school systems. International (OECD, 2010, 2015) and national (Borrini & De Sanctis, 2018; Santagati & Ongini, 2016) research reports looking at schooling in Italy record high failure rates among first- and second-generation immigrant students as compared to their Italian peers. This gap starts at primary school and widens more and more in successive school grades, up to high school, where the data show a dropout rate of 34%, while among native students the percentage is 14.8%. Both these sets of data are above the European average, which is 22.7% and 11% respectively (OECD, 2015). These hard numbers highlight the difficult educational challenge of: a) promoting paths of equity, inclusion and integration aligned to the strategic objectives outlined by the European Agenda 2020 (European Commission, 2010) and by the MIUR (Ministry of education, university and research); and b) responding to rapid societal changes, which require a paradigm adjustment. School in today’s Italy must move from literacy (singular, intended as monolingual and monocultural) to multiliteracies (plural, intended as multicultural, multilingual and sensitive to information and digital culture) that are now considered basic skills (Jewitt, 2008; Jewitt, Kress, Ogborne, & Tsatsarelis, 2001; The New London Group, 1996).

This is the context of the present study, which is based on the adaptation for children of Shakespeare's *The Merchant of Venice* (Tosi, 2015a). Our study took place in a primary school class that comprised 60% students with a migrant background1 and 40% Italian.

The educational plan represented a multi-level challenge, including:

1) The adaptation of *The Merchant of Venice* for 8-year-old children who have acquired Italian (L2) level to the consolidation stage.2 The challenge, from this point of view, was twofold: cultural and linguistic. Culturally, because in terms of curriculum, the study of Shakespeare’s works is not widespread in Italian primary and secondary schools. Shakespeare is studied only in some higher schools that study literature in depth. Furthermore, *The Merchant of Venice* is not so common, other works such as *Romeo and Juliet* and *Hamlet* being preferred. From a selection of English literature anthologies commonly used in high schools, it appears that only two books out of ten mention it. From research on children's literature (Tosi, 2015b), it emerges that English adaptations of the work for younger age groups appears to be recent and mainly dedicated to adolescents and young adults. In Italy, the first adaptation for children of *The Merchant of Venice* dates to 2015; in modern prose, it is by Laura Tosi, who

---

1 This term refers to all the children who have a migrant background. Some of them are immigrant pupils (they moved with family from their original country to Italy, in order to settle). Others are second-generation immigrant pupils (born in Italy from foreign family). Few of them are actually migrant children (family’s objective is not to remain in Italy, but to move in other country).

2 Among the eleven foreign pupils of our class six were born in Italy. The other five arrived in Italy before the age of three, so the most part of them attended three years of preschool. All foreign pupils can speak Italian at a level sufficient for daily communication. Three of them show poor lexicon and syntax. Seven of them can read with the same fluency as Italian classmates, whereas four read slower and make more mistakes. Only four children have a written production comparable with Italian peers. Seven use shorter sentences, poorer lexicon and make a greater number of orthographical mistakes.
inspired our work. Pedagogically, despite Tosi’s work being a version for children, it was found complex for eight-year-old migrant-background students because of certain lexical and syntactic features. For this reason, while we preserved the narrative scheme of Tosi’s text (Tosi, 2015a), we introduced further linguistic changes in order to make the text accessible to these younger children who were our target audience.

2) From an educational point of view, we addressed a class with a majority of Italian non-native speakers. For this reason, we decided to heighten several methods of narrative expression, verbal and non-verbal, both in reception and in production. We chose multimodal narration because it allows enhancing a range of languages: gestural/mime (in our case, shadow theatre), visual (digital photos, drawings, digitization of drawings), linguistic (oral, written, digital) and multimedia (video narration) (see sections 2 and 3).

3) From the perspective of educational research, there appears to be little research on multimodal theatrical education or on digital videos of narrative multiliteracies, in particular research aimed at Italian and European primary schools that teach significant numbers of migrant-background pupils. Narrowing the literature review to educational research activities based on Shakespeare and The Merchant of Venice, we encountered a terrain that is totally unexplored (consulted resources: Scholar, PsycInfo, ERIC).

4) From a psycho-educational perspective, we considered that as the children were only 8-year-olds, their patterns, structures and categories of narration were not yet mature (Peterson & McCabe, 1983; Spinillo & Pinto, 1994). Taking into account the migrant-background pupils, we hypothesized that their narrative structures were different from European ones (Pavlenko, 2006), assuming also that even these structures might not be fully consolidated (see section 3). “The first component of L2 narrative competence is the knowledge of conventional narrative structures in the target language and the ability to appeal to these structures in a manner appropriate to the context” (Pavlenko, 2006, p.108). Therefore, the initial aim of our workshop was to make every pupil acquire similar basic narrative structures.

Our overall research purpose was to investigate the impact of multimodal narrative activities on motivation and perceived effort, because motivation is predictive of future commitment and study choices.

The research questions were: To what extent do multimodal narration activities motivate students in their schoolwork? Is there a difference in the perceived effort in the various multimodal narration activities between the L1 (Italian students) and L2 (migrant-background students) groups? Does narrative mode (gestural/mime/theatrical or digital/video narrative) affect (and, if so, to what extent) motivation in accordance with the country of origin? Alternatively, is it the set of methods employed in narration, rather than one particular technique, that increases children's motivation?

2. Theoretical context: definitions of multiliteracies, multimodality and multicultural narrative schemes

A number of theoretical lenses focused this work. We will refer particularly to approaches characterized by 1) multiliteracies, 2) multimodality and 3) cross-cultural and cross-linguistic studies of narration.
1) The pedagogical approach to multiliteracies, which was proposed originally by the New London Group (1996), criticizes the traditional concept of literacy (singular) because it “remains centred on a single language and generally on a single national form of language and this vision of ‘unique’ language is conditioned and translated into a kind of, more or less one-way, pedagogy”. The theory of multiliteracies maintains that shifts in literacy education are unavoidable, but it does more than provide “explanations based on models of ‘cultural diversity’ or ‘multilingualism’” (Luke, 2005, p. xiii). It considers how education should address “epistemological diversity, where students bring to classrooms complex, multiple and blended background knowledges, identities and discourses, constructing identity and practice from a range of scripts” (Luke, 2005, p. xiii).

2) This approach was born in response to the theorization of new conditions of contemporary society, and it responds to various changes, among them, the increase in massive transnational migratory flows of people and the accelerated and pervasive presence of digital and multimodal environments in everyday representation and communication. It changed and is still changing the way we create, produce and represent reality and meanings (Jewitt, 2008).

3) Multimodality (Jewitt et al., 2001; Kress & van Leeuwen, 2004), like multiliteracies, emerged in response to the changing social and semiotic landscape. “Key to multimodal perspectives on literacy is the basic assumption that meanings are made (as well as distributed, interpreted, and remade) through many representational and communicational resources, of which language is but one” (Jewitt, 2008, p. 243). This and other aspects of multimodal theory are outlined by Kress and van Leeuwen (2001): “Multimodality attends to meaning as it is made through the situated configurations across image, gesture, gaze, body posture, sound, writing, music, speech, and so on” (Jewitt, 2008, p. 243). According to a multimodal perspective, all modalities rather than a single one (e.g. writing) contribute to cognitive, affective and social development because “no one mode stands alone in the process of making meaning; rather, each plays a discrete role in the whole” (Jewitt, 2008, p. 243).

4) From cross-cultural and cross-linguistic psychological studies, we learn that there are important insights into similarities and differences in narrative schemes among linguistic communities.

This hypothesis was first formulated in 1932, in Frederick Bartlett’s experiments. He investigated cross-linguistic and intercultural differences in narrative construction. Bartlett submitted a Native American tale, “The War of Ghosts”, to English readers. After they had read it, he asked them to recall the narrative. The participants found it difficult to reproduce accurately the story’s structure and many unfamiliar details disappeared in their re-telling. The subjects repeatedly tried to transform the story during their recall, both through omissions of details and through rationalizations, making the narrative structure and the lexicon conform to a model more familiar to them. Today, a branch of research literature continues to explore narrative patterns in different languages and cultures.

Western narrative structures, particularly ones in the Anglo-American tradition, favour chronological patterns centred on the subject and focused on a single event. Others, such as Japanese stories, can combine two or three similar incidents in a single story (Minami, 2002). Latin Americans stories associate things that happened in different times and places and to different people (McCabe & Bliss, 2003). Generally, conventional European and Anglo-American narratives are characterized by a problem and a resolution, while in Maori stories as well as in Russ-
ian folk legends the problem may be present but the solution may be not (Holmes, 1998; Ries, 1997). In European legends, the main character has a goal to achieve while in Japanese popular stories a goal is not required (Matsuyama, 1983). Holmes’s studies showed that Maori stories appear to be incomplete to white New Zealanders, because they expect a resolution and an ending (Holmes, 1998); McCabe and Bliss (2003) and Riessman (1991) found that Anglo-American readers perceive Latin Americans narratives as inconsistent and disconnected, because they expect stories to be about a single event. What follows from these observations of narrative discrepancy is that generally, “Speakers whose narrative styles diverge from the mainstream standard often are perceived as lacking narrative competence” (Pavlenko, 2006, p.108).

3. Educational design of The Merchant of Venice classroom project

The first stage of our workshop was preparatory to creating an adaptation of The Merchant of Venice freely drawn from Laura Tosi’s narrative re-writing of Shakespeare’s play for children. Our objective was to render the story accessible and readable, taking into account the linguistic and cultural levels of the children. This adaption also aimed to introduce new words and concepts to the children which were key to understanding the text (such as ‘ghetto’, ‘usury’, ‘pound of flesh’) and to employ a relatively elevated syntax.

Two versions of the story were provided: a longer text for the theatrical version, recited by a professional reader. She was asked to emphasize the actions, emotions and characteristics of the characters in terms of facial expression and gesture. A second, more concise, version was split up in 17 tutorial cards. Each card provided a brief narration of a scene, with a maximum of one action per character, accompanied by an image.

After the story was presented to the class, the students were involved in a story re-enactment game (stage 3). They were asked to choose a couple of scenes from those depicted on the tutorial cards and then to enact those scenes in a shadow theatre, in which one group played a scene behind a screen, illuminated only by a light shining from behind it. The child actors used only theatrical gestures and mimicry to represent their characters’ actions and feelings, while the other children, the spectators, saw only the shapes of their shadows. The spectators had the task of guessing: 1) the characters; 2) the represented scene; 3) the point in the story where the scene belonged; 4) the causes and effects connected to the scene. The number of children in each group varied, depending on how many characters were present in the scenes to be played.

To make the theatrical representation more realistic, the children wore costumes to simulate dresses of the historical period in which the story was set. For the scenography, furnishings and stylized objects in cardboard were prepared (among them, gondolas, ships, seven-arm candlesticks, three chests, caskets etc.). To increase the involvement and create an immersive experience, the locations mentioned in Tosi’s adaptation were projected onto the shadow theatre screen employing watercolour paintings representing, for example, the Venetian ghetto, the Rialto market, the port of Venice, the court and Portia’s palazzo. The objective was to recreate the atmosphere and the social, cultural and historical context in which the plot of Tosi’s telling of The Merchant of Venice unfolds.

The activity of the shadow theatre was recorded by two video cameras: one fixed, placed directly in front of the stage screen, to record the shadow scenes; one mobile, to record the children’s activities. Each scene was also photographed.
The video recordings and still photos were used as material for the subsequent workshops in which the teacher guided the production of the children's digital narration as well as for the documentation of the project and for our research.

The fourth stage included comprehension workshops for the children. Pupils reflected upon the characters, their actions and their emotions. The goals were: 1) to understand the features of each character and the motivations underlying their actions; 2) to explore the changing emotions of the characters as the story proceeded; 3) to identify, according to their temperaments, the colours that portrayed the characters. Once the children reached agreement on the choice of their protagonists’ colours, they proceeded to tint their characters’ shapes (which had been printed on a sheet of paper), and to narrate the scene with their words. These drawings were digitized and served as content for children’s video-story production.

The fifth stage included a workshop on the history of Venice and the Venetian ghetto. The children participated in role play in which they were asked to identify alternately with Shylock, Antonio and the judge and to invent an alternative ending to solve the problem of Antonio’s debt to Shylock. The goals were to encourage the children to analyse the problem from different points of view and to imagine solutions not presented in the narration. Material gathered from this stage was used to design posters to be presented to the children’s parents. The posters depicted the children at work and illustrated the most important scenes of the story, accompanied by comments written by the children.

The sixth stage was dedicated to the digital narration workshop. Using video editing software, each child narrated a scene through the digitized materials produced in the previous stages: short theatre video clips, photos of the shadow theatre (made in stage 2), drawing of the characters and written narration of the scene (realized in stage 3). The main objective was to use the various materials, previously produced, to assemble a multimedia narrative mosaic. This procedure allowed a review of the history of the project in its entirety that retraced all the actions carried out by the children themselves, constituting a form of ‘Deliberate Analysis’ as modelled by Brown & Coles, 2012 (Brown & Coles, 2012). At this stage, we introduced a choice of Renaissance music, allowing the children to explore several musical tracks and decide which ones to use, based on the emotion evoked by each scene.

In the final stage of our project, the children presented their work on *The Merchant of Venice* to their parents and teachers in a ‘showing’. This included a record of their activities, depicted in wall posters; the video story produced by the children; and a short video documentary produced by the researchers to show the stages of the project.

4. Methods and tools: intrinsic motivation

Here we analyse the impact on motivation with reference to the multimodal narrative activities of the theatre workshop and the video-narration (see sections 1 and 3). For the present exploratory study, we were inspired by the Self-Determination Theory developed by Ryan & Deci (2000). It distinguishes between different types of motivation, based on the different reasons or objectives that give rise to an action. The theory makes a fundamental distinction between “intrinsic motivation, which refers to doing something because it is inherently interesting or enjoyable, and extrinsic motivation, which refers to doing something because it leads to a separable outcome” (Ryan & Deci, 2000, p.205). Intrinsic motivation is consid-
erected an indicator of both high-quality learning and creativity, so it is important to identify the factors that enable or disable it.

The children’ intrinsic motivation, based on a 4-step Likert scale, was measured by a selection of 11 items from the Intrinsic Motivation Inventory (IMI) (Ryan & Deci, 2000).

The original questionnaire consisted of seven categories. In this exploratory study, three categories were selected: a) “perceived skill”; b) “interest”; c) “perceived effort”. These category predict their perseverance in continuing.

Three questionnaires were administered: (a) a pre-test to measure the narrative motivation in academic activities (labelled “pre-test”); (b) a post-test to measure the motivation to perform the gestural/mime narration at the end of the theatre workshop (labelled “post-test theatrical narration”); (c) a post-test, administered at the end of the video-narration workshop, to measure the motivation to perform the digital narration (labelled “post-test video narration”). These questionnaires were preceded by the compilation of data on age, gender, nationality, first language, reading habits and digital skills.

5. Participants and results

5.1. Participants

Eighteen students, aged 8, participated in the educational project. The class group consists of: 7 Italian students, 6 girls and 1 boy (L1 group) and 11 migrant-background students, 8 girls and 3 boys (L2 group). None of the children in the L2 group has Italian citizenship, despite 6 of them having been born in Italy. Their families come from 7 countries: Albania, Bangladesh, China, Egypt, Macedonia, Moldova, and the Philippines. They speak Italian at school while their languages of origin are spoken at home. The data presented below received the authorization of the parents, the teachers and the headmistress of the children’s primary school.

Before analysing the results, the reliability of the questionnaire was estimated by calculating Cronbach’s alpha coefficient. The calculation of this index had a good result: $\alpha = 0.773$. Precisely, since our sample consists of fewer than 50 subjects, the Shapiro-Wilk test was chosen, obtaining a value of sig. equal to 0.872 for theatre activities, 0.497 for video narration, 0.980 for theatre activities and video narration. It confirms the normal distribution of data (this result is established observing the normality graphs Q-Q compared).

To verify if the educational activities produced an improvement in intrinsic motivation, the t-test for dependent samples was performed on data of 18 children. The results showed a statistically significant difference in the narration scores, $t(17) = -2.91, p <.01$. The pre-test narrative-scholastic results are $M = 3.08, SD = .50, N = 18$ and the post-test video narration are $M = 3.50, SD = .41, N = 18$. The average increase was -.42, with the 95% confidence interval for the difference between the values from -.11 to -.73. The difference among pre-test and post-test theatre narration is not statistically significant, nor is the difference between the post-theatre narration and video narration.

Subsequently, in order to answer the research questions, we tried to understand if the increase in intrinsic motivation was uniform in the main activities (theatre narration and video narration) or particularly relevant in a specific activity. For this reason, the data were disaggregated for the distinct categories of motivation (narrative skills, interest, perceived effort) based on the reference activities (the-
atre narration and video narration) and the group of children (L1 and L2), in order to evaluate their impact on the children’s motivation.

5.2. Grouping for narrative skills

Regrouping data according to narrative skills, it is important to note that the change in motivation is statistically significant in children (t (17) = -2.97, p < .01), passing from the pre-test narrative-scholastic with an average of 2.98 to post-test video-narration with an average of 3.63. In addition, the change in motivation is statistically significant (t (17) = -4.42, p < 0.001) between post-test theatre narration activity (mean 3.03) and post-test video narration (average 3.63) which recorded a significant increase. Further disrupting the data for groups of students, the L2 group records an average of 2.87 in the pre-test scholastic narrative and of 3.60 in the post-test video narration, showing an increase higher than the L1 group (pre-test mean 3.14; post-test video narration mean 3.66).

5.3. Grouping by interest in the narration

Reordering the data for interest in the narration, we can see that the change in motivation is not statistically significant in children (t (17) = .06 , p >.01), passing from an average of 3.37 in the pre-test to the average of 3.51 in the post-test video narration. The change in of motivation is not statistically significant between the theatre activity (average of 3.52) and the video narration activity (average of 3.51). Breaking up the data, the L1 group registers slightly higher interest in the pre-test (mean 3.46; post-test video narration, average of 3.51). Compared to the L2 group (pre-test mean 3.32; post-test video narration mean 3.51). Note, however, that we observe an increase in both groups at the end of the workshop.

5.4. Grouping by perceived effort to narrate

The narrative perceived effort records a statistically significant change in motivation (t (17) = -4.95, p <.001), passing from an average of 2.86 in the pre-test scholastic narrative to the average of 3.40 in the post-test video narration. There is a statistically significant change (t (17) = -3.65, p <.001), passing from the average of 2.86 in the pre-test to the average of 3.38 in the post-test theatre narration. By contrast, there is no significant change between the effort perceived between theatrical activities (mean 3.38) and video narration activities (3.40). Disaggregating the data, the L2 group records a greater effort both in the pre-test stage (average 2.91) and in the post-test video narration (average 3.43) compared to the Italians (pre-test average 2.79; post-test video narration average 3.35). This difference is statistically significant (t (10) = -4.22, p <.005).

6. Discussion and conclusion

From the results of this exploratory study, we can state that the multimodal-based workshop led to a significant increase in the motivation of the whole class. Therefore, we can respond positively to the first research question. As shown in section 5, it is possible to notice interesting differences between
the two groups. We can observe that L2 group starts with a lower perception of their narrative skills than the L1 group. However, at the end of the exercise the two groups finish with very close results. It is interesting to note the comeback of the L2 group in the results of the narrative skills category between the pre- and post-test. We believe that this result is due to the fact the L2 group has gradually gained confidence and security through the diversification of narrative modes offered in the workshops. We consider it possible that these activities benefitted from confidence in the students’ narrative potential, not being exclusively focused on verbal expression.

The interest category does not record particular differences between the two groups in the pre-test and in the post-tests, but we can observe slight improvement for the L2 group. In regard to perceived effort, we note the L2 group’s perception at the pre-test stage of the need for a greater effort. The perceived effort decreases in theatrical activities and increases again in the video narration activity. They feel more confident communicating by acting.

To answer the second question, the data show that multimodal activities greatly increased the students’ involvement generally (see area of interest), but the data also recorded that L2 students were less confident of their narrative skills, probably due to the higher perceived effort. However, the L2 group seems to improve in its confidence through multimodal activities and thereby reaches a confidence equal to the L1 group. Nevertheless, we point out that the L2 group maintains a greater perceived effort in all activities compared to the L1 group.

To answer the third and fourth questions, namely which individual modality has most impacted the results or whether it was the set of experienced modalities that motivated children to narrate, we are inclined to the second option. According to the statistical data all the students appear equally motivated in the gestural/mime activity produced in the shadow theatre and in the construction of the video narration. Both activities were novelties in their educational experience and this probably led to more curiosity and involvement. Results of the theatre and video narration are, in fact, very similar and show similar increases.

Through the analysis of the workshop’s documentation videos, not presented here, we have recorded a steady interest by the children, and despite some difficulties, they showed perseverance and determination in the assigned tasks, bringing them to completion.

When asked how much success the adaptation of The Merchant of Venice had in the multimodal version, we can answer that, in addition to improving students’ motivation and confidence, it was elected “book of the year" by the students. In fact, they presented it during the local festival for “the world book day”. Their choice was for us a further confirmation of the success of our project. Moreover, when, at the end, we said goodbye to the children, they asked us: “Are you coming back next year? Can you tell us another Shakespeare story?”

The main limitations of this study are the following: first, it was not possible to test the Italian level of the L2 group. We had to rely on the teachers’ general indications and comments. It would have been interesting to compare the language levels with the results of the motivation and the video products. Second, the number of participants in this exploratory study was very small; therefore in this case, we can split out data but not generalize them. It would have been illuminating to compare these results with other research, but this was not possible for the reasons set out in section 1.

Today’s children are accustomed to using multiple languages: ranging from speaking different languages because of their different cultural origins to multimodality arising from the massive use of digital technologies. Unless educational
interventions aimed at them take this factor into account they will not excite, engage and include students. They will not, that is, be pedagogically effective.

Migrant background children begin their school path with lower narrative confidence, so any little progress becomes a great sign of their ability to express themselves. Usually children’s workshops are based on texts for children. The possibility of dealing with an adult narrative (multilinear, complex, full of characters and settings) presented a challenge for them and motivated them to discover their narrative abilities. Shakespeare’s work leveraged motivation, while the particular multimodal structure of the activities increased skills and confidence in narration activities.

Acknowledgments

This work is supported by EU project SHABEGH (CREATIVE EUROPE - CULTURE) (Project Reference: 570754-CREA-1-2016-1-IT-CULT-COOP1).

Note: for reasons of national assessment of Italian university research, the authors must declare which sections each has written, in spite of the fact that work is entirely the result of continuous and intensive collaboration. Sections 2, 5, and 6 are by M. Banzato. Section 1, 3, and 4 is by F. Coin. Our thanks to M. Hoffman, P. Cavallin and the school teachers.

References

Does a multimodal narrative workshop enhance motivation in multicultural class?


