

ISSN 0041-977X

Volume 62

Part 2

1999



*Bulletin of the
School of
Oriental and
African
Studies*

University of London

Published by
Oxford University Press

the response to Indian religions', and Part 3 focuses on the conversion of higher caste or status individuals to Protestant Christianity.

In his discussion of missionary strategies Copley contrasts the methods adopted by those missionaries who believed in the importance of preaching and itinerancy with exponents of the mission school system. Though his treatment of this issue is somewhat superficial, he goes on to raise important questions about the attitude especially of itinerant missionaries to non-Christian religions. How far were Protestant missionaries moved to learn and understand more of these faiths? What if anything did they learn from close contact with Indian society and how far, if at all, were their views modified as a result of their Indian experience? And one could add, how far was there any real difference between the attitude of those involved in schools and the response of missionaries engaged primarily in preaching?

While these are undoubtedly important questions, and ones which are central to Copley's book, his level of analysis is disappointing, and one is left with a feeling of being not much wiser or better informed at the end of the book than one was at the beginning.

The author quite correctly places missionary attitudes in a broad context, contrasting their views of Indian religions and society with those of Sir William Jones and other early 'orientalists'. However, it is important to note that while missionaries and evangelicals attacked the sympathetic views of Jones and others towards 'idolatry' or 'Hinduism', they also shared similar assumptions. One of these was that religions are like scientific objects, that they are coherent objective systems which, like scientific objects, can be classified and compared with one another—an assumption which lay at the heart of evangelical claims that religions could be placed in a hierarchy with Christianity at the top. Secondly, Copley not only draws too great a distinction between orientalist and missionaries, but bases his own argument on unquestioned assumption. He argues that 'the missionaries came [to India] remarkably ignorant of these religions'. What is the evidence, for example, in candidates' papers? Were those candidates who had read something on India as 'remarkably ignorant' as those who had read nothing? Furthermore, are there no distinctions that one might draw between, for example, the knowledge and understanding of candidates who were sons or daughters of missionaries and other applicants who had no family connection with India? But more disturbing still is the author's failure to consult basic works in the field, viz. K. A. Ballhatchet's article in C. H. Philips (ed.) *Historians of India, Pakistan and Ceylon*, (London, 1961) and the first few chapters in Eric Sharpe's work on J. N. Farquhar (Uppsala, 1965). These works would have given him some idea of the factors which help to explain the growth of an increasing openness and sympathy for non-Christian religions even among evangelicals—a trend apparent in papers and speeches at missionary conferences which the author also failed to consult.

Copley discusses the views of a number of individual missionaries and this, if anything, tends to reinforce existing interpretations (such

as those of Ballhatchet and Sharpe) that there was some flexibility and change in attitude among evangelicals. But the pity is that the author makes so little of his material. The reader is left to search through one account or quotation after another, to do his or her own research. There is no sustained analysis or closely argued conclusion. Furthermore, the failure to develop this central issue is symptomatic of the book as a whole. The author touches on caste, social reform and the relationship between missionaries and British rule without having read (or by choosing to ignore) some of the most important relevant material and without exploring these issues in any great depth.

This is a readable book, based on substantial work in the archives. Nor is the book without important insights, for example, in what Copley has to say about individual converts and their Christian teachers. But these qualities are insufficient to redeem something which, in the last analysis, adds little to our understanding either of conversion or of Protestant attitudes towards Indian society or culture.

G. A. ODDIE

ARTHUR F. BUEHLER: *Sufi heirs of the Prophet: the Indian Naqshbandiyya and the rise of the mediating Sufi shaykh*. (Studies in Comparative Religion), xxvii, 312 pp. Columbia, SC: University of South Carolina Press, 1998. \$39.95.

This well-researched analysis by the American scholar A. F. Buehler adds yet another valuable work on a Sufi order which has perhaps attracted more scholarly attention than any other over the last few decades. The fruit of several years' field-research on the Indian subcontinent with special focus on the western (Pakistani-) Punjab, the work under review uses an impressive number of scriptural sources to trace the gradual development of the traditional Sufi shaykh's role in response to the changing socio-historical circumstances in the Islamic world, with special reference to the Indian context.

The ten chapters of the book broadly define and divide the history of Sufism into three major phases. Buehler identifies three corresponding patterns of personal authority exercised by Sufi masters against the constant background of their role as nexus between the human and the Divine: the teaching-shaykh, the directing-shaykh and the mediating-shaykh. Basing his study on the representative case of the Mujaddidi branch of the Naqshbandiyya, named after the renowned Indian Sufi Ahmad Sirhindī (A.D. 1564–1624) who bears the honorific title of 'renewer (*mujaddid*) of the second millennium of Islam', the author integrates these three types of religious and spiritual leadership with the four principal sources from which traditional Sufi shaykhs derive their powerful authority: lineage, spiritual travel, as Prophetic exemplar and as transmitter of

religious and esoteric knowledge. As the title of the work suggests, major attention is here given to what is Buehler's most original contribution to the study of Indian Sufism, viz. the elaboration of the concept of what he defines as the 'mediating-shaykh', whose emergence, it is argued here, came with the establishment of British colonial rule on the subcontinent and the beginning of the modern age.

Chapter i introduces the author's general concept of Sufi authority tracing its origin in the classical Islamic sources—the Quran and the *hadith*-literature, enhanced by quotations from texts attributed to early Sufi masters. It tries to establish a parallel between four hierarchical levels of the human condition (body, mind, soul, spirit) and the four levels of participation in the reality of Islam (*islām*, *imān*, *ihsān* and *tawhīd*) expressed through the four corresponding stages of (ritual) action, (orthodox) faith, knowledge and love. Buehler associates these categories with four partly overlapping types of personal authority, viz. parents, the teaching-shaykh, the directing-shaykh and the Prophet Muhammad, as archetype of the mediator. It is argued that all four typologies converge in the ultimate source of all, at the very centre of the scheme which in the understanding of every orthodox Muslim governs the entire creation—namely God.

From a more temporal perspective, ch. ii analyses the social and historical factors which from the ninth century A.D. onwards gradually led to the transition from the archetypal model of teaching-shaykh to the more institutionalized type of directing-shaykh that went with the process of formation of the distinguished Sufi *ṭarīqas* and the crystallization of their particular spiritual practices during the following centuries.

This outline of a general development within Sufism is followed by a concise description of the Naqshbandiyya in India (from its arrival in the fifteenth century to the rise of the colonial power), its most prominent figures and their respective attitudes *vis-à-vis* both temporal power and Muslim society in general. The next two chapters focus on the concepts of genealogy and of spiritual travel as effective sources of Naqshbandi authority. Reverting to the fundamental concepts of *niṣbat* (spiritual connection), *silsila* (chain of spiritual transmission) and *suḥbat* ('spiritual communication between two hearts', p. 84), Buehler highlights first the importance of the directing-shaykh's 'inner experimental connection to the Prophet' (p. 97) which enables him to act as the mediating link between the disciple and the ultimately transcendent source of knowledge.

Buehler then explains how spiritual travel, namely the process of inner transformation and the resulting access to supernatural power, has for centuries ensured the Naqshbandi shaykh's spiritual authority. In this context, the core of Buehler's book (chs. iv–vii) gives him an opportunity to present the most essential features of the Mujaddidi doctrine, including those peculiar to this branch of the order: spiritual techniques, such as the cosmological 'science of the subtle fields' ('*ilm-i laṭā'if*', ch. v, 105–20), and the related spiritual techniques such as the 'heart invocation' (*dhikr-i qalbī*) and the 'bonding one's heart with the shaykh's' (*rābiṭa*, ch.

vi) through the transmission of spiritual energy (*tawajjuh*).

The three final chapters outline a historical framework for the claimed emergence of the mediating-shaykh in colonial Punjab on the basis of an analysis of a number of Islamic revivalist movements, all seen as responding to the challenge of European rule and education which, by the nineteenth century, had begun to affect the middle and upper classes. The modern scientific Western world-view was seen as undermining the institution of the directing-shaykh and his unquestioned authority. Using as an exemplar the case of the Naqshbandi Sufi Jamā'at 'Alī (1841–1951), Buehler elaborates on the redefinition of the shaykh's role in what he defines as 'a new expression of Naqshbandi religiosity ..., replete with a modern, English-inspired organizational style' (p. 191), tailored to the creation of a pan-Indian Islamic identity which could attract Muslims of all types from all over the country.

The bibliography is rich in both primary and secondary sources. For his treatment of the central issues, Buehler draws on a wide range of original Mujaddidi literature, whose development of a variety of genres (i.e. *ma'mulāt* literature [see Appendix 1] and monthly reviews) reflects the changing attitude of the order's authorities towards effective contact with their followers. According to Buehler, the dynamic attitude of its leaders has permitted the highest authorities of this branch, from Shaykh Ahmad to the present, to emerge as representatives of one of the subcontinent's most popular Sufi orders, successfully preserving their ancient role as mediators between God and the world and thus giving new impetus to their claim to be the real heirs of the Prophet.

This meticulously researched work is not only to be recommended to all those who are particularly concerned with the more recent developments of the Indian Naqshbandiyya but provides some useful pointers for those scholars interested in the analysis of patterns of adaptation to the challenges of modernity encountered in the great sacred traditions.

THOMAS DAHNHARDT

STEVEN KOSSAK: *Indian court painting, 16th–19th century*. ix, 142 pp. London: Thames and Hudson, 1997. £29.95.

Despite its London imprint, this is a catalogue of an exhibition held at the Metropolitan Museum, New York, from March to June 1997 to celebrate 50 years of Indian independence. The exhibition brought together two collections of Indian painting in the Metropolitan Museum, the Mughal and Deccani paintings in the Islamic Art Department, and Rajput and other non-Islamic styles in the Asian Art Department, while drawing a third of the 83 exhibits from other collections, public and private. Some of the great treasures long in the custody of the Islamic Art Department figure among a large group (18) of new and superlative purchases of Rajput painting, supporting the new gallery of Indian art. The various