

Maria Vittoria Curtolo
<https://orcid.org/0000-0003-0447-0846>

Notes on the papyri of Plato and the constitution of the text*

Manuscript received: 19 May, 2020

Manuscript accepted: 4 Nov, 2021

This is not the final published version of the paper, which is Maria Vittoria Curtolo, Notes on the papyri of Plato and the constitution of the text, *Acta Antiqua Academiae Scientiarum Hungaricae* (publisher: Akadémiai Kiadó) 61 (2021) 1, 21–32 (<https://doi.org/10.1556/068.2021.00003>).

Abstract:

In addition to other sources, Plato's dialogues are transmitted via 130 papyri that contribute to the constitution of the text. Starting from the *Corpus dei papiri filosofici greci e latini* volumes, about 1070 readings preserved by the Platonic papyri have been collected in a database, where they have been classified in different lists. For instance, the papyri may preserve new correct readings or, since in principle they represent half of the tradition, they can be seen as contributing to the choice of *adiaphora*. In addition, papyri belie conjectures much more than they confirm them, thus rehabilitating the mistrusted medieval text.

Keywords

Plato, papyri, manuscripts, text constitution, textual criticism, indirect tradition, *adiaphora*, 'radical' variants

The unearthing of Platonic papyri has allowed philologists to compare the text of Plato's dialogues in the manuscripts with the text circulating in antiquity. The most significant contribution of the papyri to the *constitutio textus* consists in 'new' good readings. But the readings of the papyri can also confirm one of the medieval *adiaphorae lectiones* (*i.e.* equally possible readings). Furthermore, the papyri can corroborate the text of the manuscripts, which was suspected and thus modified by scholars.

The Papyri and the Constitution of the Text

So far quantitative research has not been carried out on all the available Platonic papyri, in order to underline their contribution to the text constitution. Although Sijpesteijn – without dealing with critical-philological matters – produced an overall view of the papyrus testimonies, only 43 papyri were considered.¹ Today most of the Platonic papyri can be found in the Mertens-Pack database² and in the *Corpus dei papiri filosofici greci*

* I would like to thank Professor Fabio Vendruscolo for providing his guidance and support during the writing of my Master's Thesis on the Platonic papyri, discussed in July 2019 at the University of Udine.

¹ SIJPESTEIJN, P. J.: Die Platon-Papyri. *Aegyptus* 44 (1964) 26–33.

² Mertens-Pack 3 online Database: http://cipl93.philo.ulg.ac.be/Cedopal/MP3/dbsearch_en.aspx.

e latini (CPF).³ The *CPF* volumes can be considered as the basis for a preliminary assessment of the contribution of the Platonic papyri to the constitution of the text. Each reading of the papyri which can be considered useful to this purpose has been classified according to various criteria so that all the useful *lectiones* can be extracted quickly, using Burnet's complete and authoritative editions as a reference.⁴

1. Confirmation of suspected medieval readings

The papyri confirm the medieval text much more than they contradict it, even in cases in which the text has been suspected and modified. The confirmation from the papyri can often rehabilitate the mistrusted reading and lead to a recommendation of a more careful application of the conjectural criticism. After the publication of the papyri, in his second edition Burnet rejected some previously accepted conjectures (≠).⁵

≠	<i>Phd.</i> 83a8	ὅτι ἄν PPetr I 5-8 (ὅταν Burnet falso) codd. Hoog : ὅταν Tournier Blass
	<i>Phd.</i> 87c3	τινος POxy 2181 codd. Loriaux Vicaire Rowe : { τινος } Burnet Dirlmeier Strachan Verdenius 1958
	<i>Phd.</i> 96e9	γέγονεν PSI 1393b codd. Robin Vicaire Hackforth : γέγονεν , <ἢ τὸ προστεθὲν > Wytenbach Schanz Strachan
	<i>Cra.</i> 405c7–8	ὥσπερ τὸν “ἀκόλουθόν” τε καὶ τὴν “ἄκοιτιν” POxy 2663 codd. Méridier Nicoll-Duke : { ὥσπερ τὸν ἀκόλουθόν τε καὶ τὴν ἄκοιτιν } Ast
	<i>Tht.</i> 153c9	κολοφῶνα ἀναγκάζω PBerol 9782 BD T W : κολοφῶνα, [ἀναγκάζω] Cobet 1874 <i>Platonica</i>
≠	<i>Smp.</i> 201d8	διηγῆσω POxy 843 codd. Burnet ² : δὴ ἡγήσω Schanz Burnet ¹ : ἡγήσω Wilamowitz : ἐξηγήσω Richards : διήρησαι Usener

³ ADORNO, F. ET AL. (edd.): *Corpus dei papiri filosofici greci e latini* (CPF). I (Autori noti), 1.2. Firenze 1992; IDEM: *Corpus dei papiri filosofici greci e latini* (CPF). III (Commentari). Firenze 1995; IDEM: *Corpus dei papiri filosofici greci e latini* (CPF). I (Autori noti), 1.3 [Nicolaus Damascenus – Platonis Fragmenta]. Firenze 1999a; IDEM: *Corpus dei papiri filosofici greci e latini* (CPF). I (Autori noti), 1.3 [Platonis Testimonia – Zeno Tarsensis]. Firenze 1999b. The *apparati critici* in the lists have been drawn from these volumes with a few additions. The names of scholars who proposed conjectures or of editors who preferred a reading are followed by the names of scholars that approved these conjectures or readings. The information in the *apparati* of this article have been drawn from the *CPF* volumes. The references to scholars that appeared in the *apparati* can be found in the *CPF* volumes. In additions, the *apparati* with the readings of POxy 4411 (fr. 88-90+92+94-95), POxy 5078 and POxy 5493 are derived respectively from PRAUSCELLO, L., UCCIARDELLO, G.: Hands and Book-rolls in P.Oxy 4411: the First Extant Papyrus Witness for Plato's *Critias* (P.Oxy 4411, fr. 88-90+92+94-95). *ZPE* 191 (2014) 47–58; PAGANINI, M. C. D.: Plato, *Alcibiades I* 105c-d, in COLOMBO, D., CHAPA, J. (eds). *The Oxyrhynchus Papyri*, LXXVI, London 2011, 51–53; RANOCCHIA, G.: Plato, *Laches* 197ab, 200b-201b (Addenda to II 228), in GONIS, N., PARSON, P. J., HENRY, W. B. (eds). *The Oxyrhynchus Papyri*, LXXXV, London 2020, 48–52.

⁴ BURNET, J.: *Platonis Opera*. I–V. Oxonii 1900–1907 (1905²–1912²); IDEM: *Plato's Phaedo*. Oxford 1911; IDEM: *Plato's Euthyphro, Apology of Socrates and Crito*. Oxford 1924.

⁵ The readings in bold are those accepted by Burnet.

Sigla: A (Par. Gr. 1807); B (Bodl. Clarke 39); β (*fons deperdita codicorum B, [C], [D]*); C (Tubing. Mb 14); D (Marc. Gr. 185); δ (*fons deperdita codicorum W, [P], [V], [Q], [S], [A] et versio Armeniaca*); F (Vind. Suppl. Gr. 39); Λ (*fons Graeca versionis latinae a Henrico Aristippo factae*); O (Vat. gr. 1); P (Vat. Pal. Gr. 173); Q (Par. Gr. 1813); T (Marc. App. Class. IV, 1); V (Vat. Gr. 225); W (Vind. Suppl. Gr. 7); Y (Vind. Phil. Gr. 21). *Sigla* have been drawn from *CPF* 1999a, XIX–XXII.

[] = readings reconstructed *in lacuna*. The agreements of papyri with the indirect tradition (thus not with manuscripts) are indicated by I, with single manuscripts (or with a correction in manuscripts) by M and/or with a modern conjecture by C. *Ordo verborum* variants are marked with *ov*.

- ≠ *Smp.* 203a1 μαντείαν POxy 843 ([μ]ᾱ[τ]ειαν) codd. Stob. Schöne Burnet² Robin : μαγγανείαν Geel Jahn Schanz Bury : **μαγείαν** Badham Burnet¹ Sykutris
- ≠ *Smp.* 204d5 ἐρᾶ ὁ ἐρῶν POxy 843 B D T W Schöne Burnet² Robin : **ἐρῶ· ὁ ἐρῶν** Y (ἐρῶι ὁ ἐ. b) vulg. Schanz Burnet¹ Bury Lamb
- ≠ *Smp.* 204e3 ἐρᾶ ὁ ἐρῶν POxy 843 B (ἐρα) D T W Burnet² : **ἐρῶ· ὁ ἐρῶν** scr. Ald. edd. precc. : {ἐρᾶ} ὁ ἐρῶν Schanz (iam Marc. Gr. 184) : ὄρα· ὁ ἐρῶν Bury
- ≠ *Smp.* 206b1 τοῦτο POxy 843 codd. edd. recc. (et Burnet²) : **τούτου** Bast Schanz Burnet¹ Bury Ritter
- ≠ *Smp.* 207d3 τῆ γενέσει POxy 843 codd. Burnet² edd. recc. : **[τῆ γενέσει]** Vermehren Schanz Burnet¹ : τῆ γεννήσει Wolf
- Smp.* 209b2 τὴν ψυχὴν θεῖος ὦν POxy 843 codd. : τὴν ψυχὴν {θεῖος ὦν} Jahn : **τὴν ψυχὴν ἦθεος ὦν** Parmentier Dover : τὴν φύσιν θεῖος ὦν vel τὴν ψυχὴν, τὴν φύσιν θεῖος ὦν Heusde : cruces et lac. posuit Sykutris
- ≠ *Smp.* 209c1 περὶ οἷον χρῆ εἶναι POxy 843 B D T P W edd. recc. (et Burnet²) (περὶ τοῦ οἷον χρῆ εἶναι Par. Coisl. 155^{pc}) : **[περὶ] οἷον χρῆ εἶναι** Stephanus Schanz Burnet¹ Bury
- ≠ *Smp.* 210c2 καὶ ζητεῖν POxy 843 codd. Burnet² : **[καὶ ζητεῖν]** Ast Bury Dover Vicaire : **[καὶ] ζητεῖν** Badham Schanz Burnet¹
- Smp.* 217d4 ἐδεδειπνήκει POxy 843 codd. Schöne Robin (Galli Vicaire) : ἔδεδειπνήκειμεν Usener Schanz : **ἐδεδειπνήκειμεν** Bury Lamb Sykutris (δεδειπνήκαμεν Συναγωγὴ λέξεων χρησίμων [*Anecdota Bekker* I, p. 346, 23-24 = *Anecdota Bachmann* I, p. 33, 27-28] et Phot. Lexicon [α 405, I, p. 47 Theodoridis])
- ≠ *Smp.* 220c8 ἰόντων POxy 843 codd. Usener edd. recc. (et Burnet² Sykutris Vicaire) : **ιδόντων** Schmidt Burnet¹ Robin : νέων Mehler Schanz : παιόντων Rettig : ξένων Richards
- ≠ *Smp.* 222a1 ἄν τις POxy 843 codd. Burnet² : **αὐ̄ τις** Bekker Burnet¹ Bury Lamb : δὴ τις Schanz
- Phdr.* 266d7 καὶ καλῶς PCol VIII 203 codd. Herm. (p. 237, 19 Couvreur) : **[καὶ] καλῶς** Hirschig Stallbaum Thompson Schanz Buchwald : παγκάλως Vollgraff
- Phdr.* 267b10–c3 **τὰ δὲ πῶλου...ἐπέπειας** PMil Vogl 9 (ευρεπειας) codd. (ὡς B : ὅς T W cum pap.) (Λικομνιέων pap. Ast Schanz Buchwald : **Λικομνίων** codd. edd.* Wilamowitz) : varia con. Cornarius et alii
- Phdr.* 268c1 ποιεῖν PMil Vogl 9 ut vid. codd. edd.* : ἐπαίειν Schleiermacher : **[ποιεῖν]** Buttman
- Alc. I* 105d1 ὄν POxy 5078 codd. : ὅς Cobet 1874 *Platonica. ad Platonis qui fertur alcibiadem priorem* Schanz : **[ὄν]** Burnet
- Alc. I* 105d1 ὄν ἔφησθα ἐρεῖν, διὸ ἐμοῦ οὐκ ἀπαλλάττη POxy 5078 codd. Carlini Denyer: **[ὄν ἔφησθα ἐρεῖν, διὸ ἐμοῦ οὐκ ἀπαλλάττη]** Burnet

2. New correct readings of the papyri

In around fifty instances, the papyri, whose stemmatic ‘weight’ is in theory equal to half of the tradition, rectify errors in the transmitted text. Some of these readings are common to the papyri and other sources.

Only five passages have been identified as problematic (†).

- [C] *Phd.* 60e1 ἤδη PBingen 10 fort. con. iam Hirschig Strachan : ἦδειν codd. Vicaire

C	<i>Phd.</i>	82d6	τρέπονται PPetr I 5-8 coni. iam van Herwerden Usener Alline Jachmann : τρέπονται ἐκεῖνη codd. Hoog Verdenius 1958 Loriaux
I	<i>Phd.</i>	83c6	σφόδρα ἢ λυπηθῆναι PPetr I 5-8 Iamb. Burnet Vicaire Strachan : ἢ λυπηθῆναι σφόδρα β W P V T ² (add i.m.) : καὶ σφόδρα λυπηθῆναι (sed ἢ add. s.l.) : καὶ λυπηθῆναι σφόδρα Λ : deficit T
[C]	<i>Phd.</i>	83e6	ἔνεκα PPetr I 5-8 (spatii ratione) coni. iam Hermann Hirschig : ἔνεκά φασιν codd.
I	<i>Phd.</i>	92a7	δόξαι POxy 2181 (spatii ratione) T ² Stob. Gigon Vicaire Strachan : δόξασαι β δ Wohlrab Loriaux Verdenius 1958 : δόξαεν T
M	<i>Tht.</i>	151b6	ἄλλοις PBerol 9782 B ^{pc} T ^{pc} : ἄλλους BD T W
M	<i>Smp.</i>	201d7	ἐπ' ἔμαντοῦ POxy 843 Par. Coisl. 155 ^{pc} Par. Gr. 1642 ^{sl} Bast edd. : ἀπ' ἔμαντοῦ BD T (ἀπ) W : ὑπ' ἔμαντοῦ V Vat. Ross. 558
†	<i>Smp.</i>	204b2	ὦν ἄν εἶη POxy 843 Schöne Burnet ² Robin : ὦν ἄν B D T W vulg. : ὦν αὖ Y Marc. Gr. 184 Bekker Burnet ¹ Bury Lamb : ὦν δὴ Usener Schanz Sykutris Wilamowitz Ritter : ὦν Rückert : ὦν εἶς prop. Bury
C	<i>Smp.</i>	208b4	μετέχει POxy 843 coni. iam Stephanus : μετέχειν codd. Vögelin
M	<i>Smp.</i>	208e2	κατὰ τὰ σώματα POxy 843 Par. Gr. 1812 Lobc. VI Fa 1 Schanz Burnet ² edd. recc. : κατὰ σώματα B D T P W Burnet ¹ Lamb vulg.
†C	<i>Smp.</i>	209a2	κυῆσαι τε καὶ τεκεῖν POxy 843 ^{pc} Hug (κυῆσαι καὶ τεκεῖν) (τίκτειν iam Jahn) (κυῆσαι καὶ τεκεῖν vel κυῆσαι καὶ γεννᾶν coni. iam Teuffel) edd.* : κυῆσαι καὶ κυεῖν codd. (κυεῖν B T) Maass Morrison
C	<i>Smp.</i>	209b3	ἐπιθυμῆ POxy 843 coni. iam Stephanus edd. pll. (et Burnet ²) : ἐπιθυμεῖ codd. Burnet ¹ Sykutris Dover
M	<i>Smp.</i>	209d6	κατελίπετο POxy 843 b V edd. pll. : κατελείπετο T P W vulg. : κατέλιπεν το B(?) : κατέλιπε τὸ D : κατέλιπεν τοῖς Y : κατέλιπεν αὐτοῦ Rettig
I	<i>Smp.</i>	210a9–b1	τὸ ἐπὶ ... τῷ ἐπὶ ἑτέρῳ POxy 843 Them. (τὸ ἐφ' ... τῷ ἐφ') : τὸ ἐπὶ... τὸ ἐπὶ ἑτέρῳ BD : τῷ ἐπὶ ... τῷ ἐπὶ ἑτέρῳ W : τὸ ἐπὶ ... τῷ ἑτέρῳ T P
M	<i>Smp.</i>	212a6	θεοφιλεῖ POxy 843 P ^{pc} t : θεοφιλεῖ B D T P ^{ac} W
†	<i>Smp.</i>	213b2	ως ἐκεῖνον κατιδε[ιν POxy 843 (κατεῖδε[ν integr. Grenfell – Hunt vel κατίδεν (sic) Vicaire vel κατεῖδεν Bury ¹ vel κατιδε[ῖν Wilamowitz) edd. pll. (et Burnet ²) : ὡς ἐκεῖνον καθίζειν codd. : [ὡς ἐκεῖνον καθίζειν] Badham Schanz Burnet ¹
	<i>Smp.</i>	217c6	ἐγκεχειρήκη POxy 843 : ἐγκεχειρήκη B D T : ἐγκεχειρήκει d W : ἐγκεχειρήκειν Y vulg.
M	<i>Smp.</i>	218d3	μοι συλλήπτορα POxy 843 Y Par. Gr. 1810 vulg. edd. : μου συλλήπτορα B D T W
†	<i>Smp.</i>	219c5–6	καὶ περὶ ἐκεῖνό γε POxy 843 edd.* (et Burnet ²) : καίπερ ἐκεῖνό γε T W : καίπερ κείνό γε B D : καὶ κείνό γε Schanz : καίτοι κείνό γε Burnet ¹ : καὶ περὶ ἐκεῖνο ὄ γε Bury Lamb
M	<i>Smp.</i>	220c4	εἰστήκει POxy 843 Y Par. Gr. 1810 : ἐστήκει B D T PW vulg.
C	<i>Smp.</i>	222d6	διαβαλεῖ POxy 843 coni. iam Hirschig edd.* : διαβάλη codd. : διαβάλλει Y : διαλάβη Rettig
M	<i>Phdr.</i>	227b10	ποιήσασθαι POxy 1016 Par. Gr. 1811 Esc. y. I. 13 Schanz Bekker Alline 1910 : ποιήσεσθαι B T W Verdenius 1955
C	<i>Phdr.</i>	228b5	πάνυ τι POxy 1016 coni. iam Schanz edd. recc. : πάνυ τις B T W Alline 1910 Verdenius 1955
M	<i>Phdr.</i>	230c7	σὺ δέ γε POxy 1016 T ² Vat. Barb. Gr. 270 (γε supra δέ) Par. Gr. 1811 (σὺ οὐδέ γε) Esc. y. I. 13 (σὺ supra οὐ) : οὐ B T WP
M	<i>Phdr.</i>	230d6	σὺ POxy 1016 T ² Par. Coisl. 155 Par. Gr. 1811 Esc. y. I. 13 Vat. Barb. Gr. 270 Laur. 85, 6 : οὐ B T WP
[IM]	<i>Phdr.</i>	246a6–7	ἔοικέτω δὴ POxy 1017 ut vid. W ² t Stob. : ἔοικέ τω (vel τῷ) B T P Herm. Verdenius 1955 : ἔοικέ δὴ τω W Par. Gr. 1808

I	<i>Phdr.</i> 246b7	ψυχὴ πᾶσα POxy 1017 Plot. Herm. Simp. Robin Moreschini 1985 : πᾶσα ἢ ψυχὴ B Bekker Moreschini 1965 : ἡ ψυχὴ πᾶσα T W : πᾶσα ψυχὴ Par. Gr. 1810
C	<i>Phdr.</i> 251a6	ἐδεδίδει POxy 1017 conl. iam Cobet 1858 : δεδίδει T W : δεδιδεῖ B (-εῖη punctis notatum) : δεδεῖη P
C	<i>Phdr.</i> 267c9	ἀνήρ PMil Vogl 9 (άνηρ) conl. iam Bekker Cobet 1860 Vinzent : ἀνήρ codd.
C	<i>Phdr.</i> 268c2	ἄνθρωπος PMil Vogl 9 (άνθρωπος) conl. iam Bekker : ἄνθρωπος codd.
I	<i>Alc.</i> 1 132c1	δὴ ὅτι POxy 3666 Stob. : δὲ ὅτι PT W : ἤδη B C D
M	<i>Alc.</i> 2 142d6	αὐτοὶ σφῆσιν POxy 3667 t Marc. Gr. 186 : αὐτοῖς φησὶν B pr. C D : αὐτοὶ σφίσιν T
C	<i>Chrm.</i> 173b5	ἢ ὑγιέσιν POxy 5082 conl. Heindorf : ὑγιέσιν B T W Q : μὴ ὑγιέσιν Stob.
M	<i>La.</i> 190c1	αὐτὸ PPetr II 50 conl. edd. (Par. Coisl. 155 Par. Gr. 1811 Vat. Gr. 1029) : αὐτῷ B T
C	<i>La.</i> 191b6–7	τὸ μὲν γὰρ ἵππικὸν οὕτω μάχεται PPetr II 50 (τὸ μὲν γὰρ ἵππικὸν [τὸ ἐκείνων] οὕτω μάχεται) conl. iam Badham : τὸ μὲν γὰρ ἵππικὸν τὸ ἐκείνων οὕτω μάχεται B T W Croiset
C	<i>La.</i> 191c7	ὁ ἄρτι PPetr II 50 Vicaire Croiset : ἄρτι conl. iam Ast : αἴτιον B T W
†	<i>La.</i> 197d1	οὐδὲ POxy 228 + POxy 5493 Vicaire : οὐδὲ μὴ B T W (et Marc. Gr. 184) : τοῦδὲ μὴ Keck Croiset
M	<i>La.</i> 197d8	προεστάναι POxy 228 + POxy 5493 Q Vat. Gr. 1029 Marc. Gr. 186 edd. : προῖσταναι B T W
[I]	<i>La.</i> 197e1	πρέπει μὲν που fort. POxy 228 + POxy 5493 (]που) Stob. (IV 5, 90) : πρέπει μέντοι B T W Croiset Vicaire
C	<i>La.</i> 197e9	δὴ POxy 228 + POxy 5493 conl. iam Schanz Croiset Vicaire : δὲ B T W : γε Par. Coisl. 155 ^{pc} Ed. Turner
M	<i>La.</i> 200b2	σαυτὸν POxy 228 + POxy 5493 ([cau]τον) Par. Coisl. 155 ^{pc} : αὐτὸν B T : αὐτὸν W
MC	<i>Grg.</i> 502d2	ῥητορικὴ PVindob G 39880 + PVindob G 26001 Laur. 89, 78 conl. Heindorf Dodds : ἡ ῥητορικὴ B T W F
M	<i>R.</i> 610d3	τοῦτο POxy 3157 β ^{pc} : τούτου A D F Schneider
M	<i>Lg.</i> 797b1	κατὰ τὰ PHarris 42 ut vid. (spatii ratione) O ² : κατὰ A O

3. New *adiaphora* that can improve the text

More often it is the case that the readings of the papyri contradict an acceptable medieval text. Yet the *CPF* editors and the editors of later discovered papyri promote about seventy of these readings from unacceptable to acceptable, or at least equally possible.⁶

M	<i>Phd.</i> 60e1	ὅτι PBingen 10 Marc. Gr. 184 : ὡς οὐ T δ Schanz (exp. [ὅτι]) Archer-Hind edd. recc. : ὡς ὅτι οὐ β
I	<i>Phd.</i> 65b2	ἡ ὄψις τε καὶ ἀκοὴ PLeiden inv. 22 Olymp. Daniel : ὄψις τε καὶ ἀκοὴ β T δ Iamb. Vat. Gr. 2066 edd. Verdenius 1966 Lenaerts
I	<i>Phd.</i> 66a3	ἐπιχειροῖη PLeiden inv. 22 Iamb.: ἐπιχειροῖ β(et B) T δ (η add. B ² s.l. pro ἐπιχειρῆ vel ἐπιχειροῖη)
ov	<i>Phd.</i> 68b8	ἰκανόν σοι, ἔφη, τεκμήριον τοῦτο PPetr I 5-8 : ἰκανόν σοι τεκμήριον, ἔφη, τοῦτο codd. Verdenius 1958

⁶ Further details (for example the greater or lesser possibility of a reading of being correct) can be read in the analysis of these readings in the *CPF* volumes.

- I *Phd.* 68e5 την ἀνδραποδώδη σωφοροσύνην PPetr I 5-8 sch. in Phdr. 258e4-5 Blass Carlini (*CPF*) : **τὴν εὐήθη σωφοροσύνην** codd. edd. Usener Alline Jachmann Bickel Verdenius 1958
- Phd.* 69a1–2 συμβαίνει δ' οὖν PPetr I 5-8 Alline Bickel Vicaire Strachan : **ἀλλ' ὁμως συμβαίνει** codd. Iamb. Stob. Usener Robin
- Phd.* 82b5 εἰκός PPetr I 5-8 Usener Blass Vicaire (εἰκός [ἔστιν]) : **εἰκός ἐστιν** codd. POxy 2181 Eus. Stob. Strachan
- Phd.* 83b7 τις τι PPetr I 5-8 : **τις** codd. Iamb.
- Phd.* 84a8–9 τὸ ἀληθές καὶ θεῖον καὶ ἀδόξαστον PPetr I 5-8 Blass Jachmann Hoog: **τὸ ἀληθές καὶ τὸ θεῖον καὶ τὸ ἀδόξαστον** codd. Iamb. edd.
- Phd.* 92d4–5 ἔαν τις αὐτοὺς μὴ φυλάττηται εὖ μάλα, ἐξαπατῶσι POxy 2181 Rowe Strachan (ἄν) : **ἄν τις αὐτοὺς μὴ φυλάττηται, εὖ μάλα ἐξαπατῶσι** codd. edd. pll.
- Plt.* 280e7 τοῦτο τὸ λελειμμένον POxy 1248 : **τοῦτο λελεγμένον** β T W Robinson : τοῦτο τέλεον λελεγμένον Y
- Plt.* 281c4 συναιτίους POxy 1248² : **συναιτίας** POxy 1248¹ codd.
- C *Phlb.* 61d7 ἀληθῆς PKöln 135 con. iam Schleiermacher Stallbaum : **ἀληθῶς** codd.
- C *Smp.* 202a3 ἄνευ POxy 843 con. iam Stallbaum edd.* : **καὶ ἄνευ** codd. Robin
- Smp.* 202a7 τοιοῦτο POxy 843 : **τοιοῦτον** codd.
- I *Smp.* 203a5–6 ἢ περὶ τέχνας ἢ περὶ χειρουργίας POxy 843 Stob. Bury Schöne Ritter : **ἢ περὶ τέχνας ἢ χειρουργίας** codd.
- I *Smp.* 203a7 τε καὶ POxy 843 Stob. Bury Ritter : **καὶ** codd. Procl. (*In Alc.* 72, 14-15, [I, p. 58 Segonds])
- Smp.* 203b6 ἐξεληθὼν POxy 843 Schöne Ritter Maas : **εἰσεληθὼν** codd. Origen. Eus. Plot. III 5, 8, 2 (εἰσηλθεν)
- I *Smp.* 203e3 πάλιν πάλιν δὲ POxy 843^{pc} Origen. : **πάλιν δὲ** POxy 843^{ac} codd.
- Smp.* 204d7 δ' οἷαν δεῖ fort. POxy 843^{ac} : τοιανδί POxy 843^{pc(m1?)} : **τοιάνδε** codd.
- Smp.* 205b7 ἢ γάρ τῷ POxy 843 (τῷ circumflexit corrector) Schöne Ritter Sykutris : ἢ γάρ τι B D T W : **ἢ γάρ τοι** Y
- Smp.* 205c7 ταῦτα μόνον POxy 843 : **τοῦτο μόνον** B D T W edd.
- Smp.* 206c1 δὴ POxy 843 : ἦδη codd. : **ἦ δ' ἦ** corr. Bekker edd.
- C *Smp.* 206c5 ἐν δὲ καλῷ POxy 843 con. iam Badham Bury Schöne Vicaire : **ἐν δὲ τῷ καλῷ** codd. edd.*
- Smp.* 207c2 ἔλεγον POxy 843 Schöne : ἄν ἔλεγον T W : ἀνέλεγον B D : **αὖ ἔλεγον** b Y edd. recc.
- Smp.* 207c8 ὠμολογήσαμεν POxy 843^{pc} (-coμεν a.c.) Schöne : **ὠμολογήκαμεν** codd. edd.*
- Smp.* 209d2 καὶ εἰς Ἡσίοδον POxy 843 Bury Galli Ritter Maas: **καὶ Ἡσίοδον** codd.
- Smp.* 210a4 πειρῶ δὲ καὶ σὺ POxy843 Bury Schöne Lamb Vicaire Maas Slings : **πειρῶ δὲ** codd. (Dover) Robin
- ον *Smp.* 212c5 ἐπιχειρεῖν λέγειν τι POxy 843 : **λέγειν τι ἐπιχειρεῖν** codd. edd.
- M *Smp.* 220b5 ἐν τούτοις POxy 843 Y : **δ' ἐν τούτοις** B D T P W edd.
- [M] *Smp.* 220c1 δὴ ταύτη POxy 843 ut vid. Y : **δὴ ταῦτα** B D T P W
- Smp.* 220d6 καὶ ἐν ταῖς μάχαις POxy843 : **ἐν ταῖς μάχαις** codd. edd.
- [] *Smp.* 221c3 ἀλλὰ τῶν ἄλλων POxy 843 ut vid. (spatii ratione) : **ἀλλὰ τῶν μὲν ἄλλων** codd.
- Smp.* 221c4 τὸ δὲ δὴ POxy 843 Schöne Sykutris : **τὸ δὲ** codd. edd.*
- Smp.* 223b4 εἴσω ἄντικρυς POxy 843 Sykutris Ritter Wilamowitz Maas : **εἰς τὸ ἄντικρυς** codd. edd.*
- Phdr.* 227c5 γέγραφε μὲν γὰρ δὴ POxy 1016 Buchwald (γέγραφε μὲν γὰρ) Vinzent de Vries : **γέγραφε γὰρ δὴ** codd.
- Phdr.* 227c7 λέγει POxy 1016 ut vid. : **λέγει γὰρ** codd.

MC	<i>Phdr.</i> 228b7	ιδών μὲν POxy 1016 t corr. Par. Coisl. 155 ^{pc} coni. iam Hermann (alii alia) : ιδών μὲν ιδών B T (ιδών μὲν, ιδών Burnet) : del. Schanz
	<i>Phdr.</i> 228e4	ποι POxy 1016 : ποι codd. de Vries
	<i>Phdr.</i> 229b7	καὶ ἐνθένδε POxy 1016 Vinzent : ἐνθένδε codd.
MI	<i>Phdr.</i> 229e1	πλήθη τε καὶ ἀτοπία PPOxy 1016 Par. Gr. 1811 Par. Gr. 1812 ^{pc} Ath. : πλήθη τε καὶ ἀτοπία B T W Gal.
I	<i>Phdr.</i> 230b7	ὡς γε POxy 1016 Aristaenet. Herm. : ὥστε γε B T W P : ὡς τό γε D
	<i>Phdr.</i> 230d6	μέντοι γε POxy 1016 : μέντοι codd.
	<i>Phdr.</i> 239d2	ἄ δὴ δήλα POxy 1017 ² : ἄ δήλα POxy 1017 ¹ b t Stob. (ἄδηλα B T W P)
	<i>Phdr.</i> 240a2	ἑαυτὸν POxy 1017 : αὐτὸν cett.
	<i>Phdr.</i> 243c2	κληθεῖς PTurner 7+POxy 2102: ῥηθεῖς codd. edd. Vinzent
I	<i>Phdr.</i> 245e2	συμπεσοῦσαν POxy 1017 Stob. Philp. : συμπεσοῦσαν στήναι codd.
	<i>Phdr.</i> 246a6	ταύτη οὖν δὴ λέγωμεν POxy 1017 Alline 1910 : ταύτη οὖν λέγωμεν codd. Psell. Vinzent de Vries
	<i>Phdr.</i> 246c3	περορρησασα πῶς POxy 1017 ut vid. Buchwald Alline 1910 Wilamowitz Vinzent : περορρησασα codd. Moreschini 1966 et 1985 de Vries
	<i>Phdr.</i> 248a1	καὶ οὗτος μὲν δὴ θεῶν βίος POxy 1017 : καὶ οὗτος μὲν θεῶν βίος codd.
	<i>Phdr.</i> 248a2	ἐπομένη POxy 1017 : ἐπομένη καὶ εἰκασμένη codd.
	<i>Phdr.</i> 251a2–3	ὅταν τι θεοειδὲς ἴδη πρόσωπον κάλλος εὖ μεμιμημένον POxy 1017 : ὅταν θεοειδὲς πρόσωπον ἴδη κάλλος εὖ μεμιμημένον codd.
C	<i>Phdr.</i> 267c2	Λικουμνείων PMil Vogl 9 coni. iam Ast Schanz Buchwald : Λικουμνίων codd. edd.* Wilamowitz 1895 ²
ov	<i>La.</i> 190c1	ὅπως ... κάλλιστα ἂν PPetr II 50 Jachmann Hoog: ὅπως ἂν ... κάλλιστα B T Croiset Vicaire
	<i>La.</i> 191e4	οὐκοῦν ἀνδρεία μὲν πάντες οὗτοί ἀνδρεῖοι PPetr II 50 Christ 1895 Blass Ed. Turner Wilamowitz Coppola Pasquali : οὐκοῦν ἀνδρεῖοι μὲν πάντες οὗτοί εἰσιν B T W edd. Jachmann Hoog
C	<i>La.</i> 200b5	προσποιεῖ POxy 228 + POxy 5493 coni. iam Badham : που οἶει codd. : τι οἶει Schanz
	<i>La.</i> 200d5	γέ τοι δὴ POxy 228 + POxy 5493 : γέ τοι codd.
	<i>La.</i> 200d7	τι ἡμῖν POxy 228 + POxy 5493 : τι codd.
	<i>Ly.</i> 208c6	τί δὲ καὶ POxy 881v Wilamowitz Martinelli Tempesta : τί δὲ B T W : τί καὶ Vat. Gr. 226
	<i>Ly.</i> 208d2	ὡς ἔοικεν ἐκὼν POxy 881v : ἐκὼν codd. Jachmann
	<i>Euthd.</i> 302c4	οἰκεῖα καὶ om. POxy 881r : οἰκεῖα καὶ codd.
I	<i>Prt.</i> 351b1	γε καὶ POxy 1624 Stob. (III 7, 73) : τε καὶ B T W
C	<i>Prt.</i> 356c7	αἰ φωναὶ αἰ ἴσαι POxy 1624 ^{m1} coni. iam Heindorf : αἰ φωναὶ ἴσαι POxy 1624 ^{m2} B T W Hermann : φωναὶ αἰ ἴσαι Deuschle
	<i>Grg.</i> 495c5	ἔλεγές τι εἶναι POxy 3156 + POxy 3669 Haslam 1984 : ἔλεγές τινα εἶναι codd. Dodds Díaz de Cerio Díez – Serrano Cantarín
	<i>Grg.</i> 495e1	δέ POxy 3156 + POxy 3669 : δέ γε codd. edd.
	<i>Hp.Ma.</i> 291e5	δὴ νῦν νῶν POxy 3670 ut vid. : ἡμῶν δὴ νῦν T F : ἡμῶν νῦν δὴ W P
	<i>R.</i> 473d5	ἀποκληῖ[cθ]ω[civ] POxy 3679 : ἀποκλεισθῶσιν A D F Bessarion : ἀποκαθιστῶσιν Stob.
	<i>R.</i> 545c3	δημοτικόν POxy 3326 ut vid. (spatii ratione) : δημοκρατικόν codd. Slings Boter
ov	<i>R.</i> 610c10	θανάσιμον εἶναι POxy 3157 : εἶναι θανάσιμον A D F
ov	<i>R.</i> 612a3	αὐτῆς ἴδοι POxy 3157 : ἴδοι αὐτῆς A D F
	<i>Ti.</i> 19d3	ἀλλὰ καὶ τὴν PSI 1201 : ἀλλὰ τὴν codd.
M	<i>Criti.</i> 120d7	αὐτοὺς fort. POxy 4411(fir. 88-90+92+94-95) (αυτο[uc] Vat. Urb. Gr. 29 : αὐ τοὺς codd.*

	<i>Criti.</i> 120d7	ἐπὶ τούσδε αὐτοὺς POxy 4411(frr. 88-90+92+94-95) : ἐπὶ τούσδε αὐτοὺς τούτους τόπους codd.* : ἐπὶ τούσδε αὐτοὺς τόπους Vat. Urb. Gr. 29
[M]	<i>Lg.</i> 865c7	χρησάσθω fort. POxy 3675 O ^{PC} (O ² Burnet Greene vel O ⁴ Diès) : χρήσασθαι A O liber Patriarcae
	<i>Just.</i> 372a7	ὅτι ᾧ PAnt 79 : ᾧ codd.
	<i>Virt.</i> 376b6	γενέσθαι PHaw 26 : γίγνεσθαι codd.

4. ‘Radical’ variants

Papyri are characterized also by variants that cannot be explained as mechanical errors. (e.g. abbreviated formulations, expansions). Owing to readings of this kind and which are widespread in the Flinders Petrie papyri of the Ptolemaic period, Turner coined the scathing definition of ‘wild papyri’.⁷ Indeed, the publication of these two papyri at the end of the 19th century⁸ created a division between the defenders of the medieval tradition and those who believed that papyri continued a different traditional line. Nevertheless, it can be argued that the papyri should not be downgraded as they are the ‘closest’ testimony to Plato’s dictation. In his study on PPetrie II 50, Carlini pointed out that this source, which represents a different tradition, cannot be labelled as ‘wild’ since sometimes it reveals itself as «priva di incrostazioni fiorite nel testo dei codici o di restauri maldestri».⁹

In his introduction to the reedition of PMich 5980 in *CPF*, as an explanation for this kind of operation, Renner suggests, on the one hand, the hypothesis of the ‘copy through inner dictation’ («copia attraverso dettato interiore») and, on the other one, the category of ‘creative writing’ («scrittura creativa»)¹⁰.

	<i>Phd.</i> 68a4	ἢ παίδων ἔνεκα PPetr I 5-8 Vicaire Christ 1893 Blass Bickel 1943 (<i>Schriftenkorpus</i>) Carlini 1968 : καὶ ὑέων B T W edd.* Jachmann Hoog : καὶ γυναικῶν καὶ ὑέων exp. Verdenius 1958
M	<i>Phd.</i> 68b3–4	μη]θαμου αλλοθι [..... κα]θαρωσ φρονησει εν[[PPetr I 5-8 B (i.m.) (ἄλλοθι δυνατόν εἶναι καθαρῶς φρονήσει ἐντυχεῖν ἄλλ’ ἢ ἐκεῖ) (ἄλλ’ ἢ ἐκεῖ om. PPetr I 5-8) Korkisch Alline Jachmann Bickel : μηδαμοῦ ἄλλοθι καθαρῶς ἐντεύξεσθαι φρονήσει ἄλλ’ ἢ ἐκεῖ codd.*
	<i>Phd.</i> 68b9	ἀγανακτοῦντα [τούτῳ] (integravit Usener) vel [θανάτῳ] (integravit Jachmann) PPetr I 5-8 Bickel(τούτῳ) : ἀγανακτοῦντα μέλλοντα ἀποθανεῖσθαι codd. edd. Ritter Usener Verdenius 1958 Hoog
	<i>Phd.</i> 69a1–2	συμβαίνει δ’ οὖν PPetr I 5-8 Alline Bickel Vicaire Strachan : ἀλλ’ ὁμῶς συμβαίνει codd. Iamb. Stob. Usener Robin
	<i>Phd.</i> 81b7	σοφία PPetr I 5-8 Couvreur Korkisch : φιλοσοφία codd. Eus. Stob. edd. Hoog
	<i>Phd.</i> 82d4–5	ἡγούνται δὲ οὐ δεῖν ἐναντία τῇ φιλοσοφίᾳ PPetr I 5-8 : αὐτοὶ δὲ ἡγούμενοι οὐ δεῖν ἐναντία τῇ φιλοσοφίᾳ codd.

⁷ TURNER, E. G.: *Greek Papyri. An Introduction*. Oxford 1968 (1980²), 108.

⁸ MAHAFFY, J. P.: *Fragments of the Phaedo of Plato*. In MAHAFFY, J. P. (ed.): *The Flinders Petrie Papyri with Transcriptions, Commentaries and Index*. Dublin 1891, 18–28; MAHAFFY, J. P.: *Fragments from the Laches of Plato*. In MAHAFFY, J. P. (ed.): *The Flinders Petrie Papyri with Transcriptions, Commentaries and Index*. Dublin 1893, 165–175.

⁹ CARLINI, A.: *PPetrie II 50*. In ADORNO ET AL. (edd.): *CPF I.1.3 (Platonis Testimonia – Zeno Tarsensis)* (n. 5) 167.

¹⁰ RENNER, T.: *PMich 5980*. In ADORNO ET AL. (edd.): *CPF I.1.3 (Platonis Testimonia – Zeno Tarsensis)* (n. 5) 217 (Italian translations by FASSINO M.).

<i>Phd.</i>	100b6-7	αὐ]τὸ ± 23]]. . [] α ἀκέραιον καὶ ἄλ[λα PMich 5980 : αὐτὸ καθ' αὐτὸ καὶ ἀγαθὸν καὶ μέγα καὶ τᾶλλα codd.
<i>Smp.</i>	209e2	πολλά και αλλα και γεννησαντες POxy 843 Schöne : πολλά και καλὰ ..., γεννήσαντες codd.
<i>Smp.</i>	212b7	ἐγκωμιάζω POxy 843 ^{pc} codd. : ἐγκωμιάζω τὸν ἔρωτα POxy 843 ^{ac}
<i>Smp.</i>	219d6–7	εἰς ἐγκράτειαν POxy 843 Schöne Galli Maas : εἰς καρτερίαν codd. edd.*
<i>Smp.</i>	219d7–8	εἰ καὶ ἀποστερηθεῖν POxy 843 : καὶ ἀποστερηθεῖν codd.
<i>Smp.</i>	219d8	συνηθείας POxy 843 ^{ac} : συνουσίας POxy 843 ^{pc(m2?)} codd.
<i>La.</i>	191b8	τούτους PPetr II 50 Blass Ed. Turner Jachmann : λακεδαμονίους B T W edd.
<i>La.</i>	197d3	παρείληφα POxy 228 + POxy 5493 : παρείληφεν B T W

5. Readings that can help choose between *adiaphora*

As stated above, when the primary manuscripts diverge, papyri usually confirm the correct reading provided by the majority (or equally split) tradition. Yet, in many cases it is difficult (and subjective) to choose between two clashing medieval *adiaphora lectiones*. The external testimony provided by the papyri can – and normally should – be considered as decisive. According to the opinions of the editors of the *CPF*, the papyri have a settlement function in about thirty ‘new’ cases where the medieval manuscripts force us to make a *selectio* between already known *adiaphora*.

Linguistic and conceptual evidence has also proved the superiority of some readings already highlighted by the papyri. Moreover, one third of these readings is preserved by indirect testimonies and/or isolated manuscripts as well.

<i>Ap.</i>	40c10	εἶτε PBerol inv. 21210+13291 β δ Stob. Eus. (DN) : εἶτε δὴ T Eus. (cett.)
<i>Phd.</i>	65e8	μήτε τὴν PLeiden inv. 22 codd.* Iamb. Clem.Al. : μήποτε τὴν W Λ : μήτε τιν' conl. Burnet
<i>Phd.</i>	68a5	ἐλθεῖν PPetr I 5-8 β W P Q V Λ T ² Hoog Mewaldt Carlini 1968 : μετελθεῖν B ² (i.m.) T Vicaire Strachan
<i>Phd.</i>	82b7	ἦ καὶ POxy 2181 (spatii ratione) β P Q V Λ W ² Eus. Stob. Robin Vicaire Strachan : καὶ T Niceph. : ἦ W
≠1	<i>Phd.</i> 82c3	φιλόσοφοι PPetr I 5-8 T Iamb. Burnet ² Verdenius 1958 Vendruscolo : φιλοσοφοῦντες β δ Burnet ¹
<i>Phd.</i>	83b8	ἦσθῆ ἢ λυπηθῆ ἢ φοβηθῆ ἢ ἐπιθυμήσῃ PPetr I 5-8 (ησθει) P Q V Λ B ² W (καὶ λυπ. W) Iamb. Vicaire Strachan Loriaux : ἦσθῆ ἢ φοβηθῆ ἢ λυπηθῆ ἢ ἐπιθυμήσῃ T : ἦσθῆ ἢ φοβηθῆ ἢ ἐπιθυμήσῃ β (ἦσθῆ ἢ φοβηθῆ [ἢ λυπηθῆ] ἢ ἐπιθυμήσῃ Jachmann Bickel)
<i>Phd.</i>	83c2	ἔσχατον PPetr I 5-8 (Blass) (ἔσχατόν ἐστι Mahaffy falso) δ : ἔσχατόν ἐστι codd.*
<i>ov</i>	<i>Phd.</i> 83d8	ὁμότροφός τε καὶ ὁμότροπος PPetr I 5-8 W P Q V Λ Hoog : ὁμότροπός τε καὶ ὁμότροφος β T Iamb. : ὁμοιότροφος τε καὶ ὁμότροπος B ²
<i>ov</i>	<i>Phd.</i> 83d10	ἄει ἀναπλέα τοῦ σώματος PPetr I 5-8 T δ Iamb. Hoog : ἄει τοῦ σώματος ἀναπλέα β edd.
<i>Phd.</i>	85d7	ἄ μοι ἐδόκει POxy 2181 D W P Q V B ² Haslam : ἄ μοι δοκεῖ T Burnet Vicaire Strachan : ἄ ἐμοὶ δοκεῖ BCd
<i>ov</i>	<i>Phd.</i> 103c3	ἔφη ὦ Κέβης POxy 1809 T W P Q Λ Strachan: ἔφη ὁ Κέβης V : ὦ Κέβης ἔφη β edd.*
<i>Phd.</i>	104a7	οὕτω πως POxy 2181 ut vid. (spatii ratione) codd.* : οὕτως T Λ
<i>Phd.</i>	108c5	ἐκάστη POxy 2181 T W Λ : ἐκάστη β P Q S V S Stob. Wohlrab 1890 Archer-Hind Dirlmeier Strachan

- Cra.* 405c6 τοξικῆ POxy 2663 β T : **τοξικῆς** δ
- Plt.* 305e2 ἀπασῶν PSI 1484+POslo 9+POxy 5092 T W: **πασῶν** B D edd.
- Smp.* 202e8–203a1 τὰς θυσίας καὶ τὰς τελετὰς καὶ τὰς ἐπωδὰς POxy 843 B D Stob. : **τὰς θυσίας καὶ τελετὰς καὶ τὰς ἐπωδὰς** T W : τὰς θυσίας καὶ τελετὰς καὶ ἐπωδὰς Esc. y. I. 13
- Smp.* 203e2 θάλλει καὶ ζῆ POxy 843 B D Origen. Schanz : **θάλλει τε καὶ ζῆ** T W edd.*
- Smp.* 204c3 οἴομαι POxy 843 T Schöne : **οἴμαι** B D W edd.*
- Smp.* 209b1 αὖ POxy 843 B D edd.* : **δ’ αὖ** T P W vulg. Robin
- Smp.* 212e5 ἐφ’ ὅπερ POxy 843 T W vulg. : **ἐφ’ ὅπερ** B D edd.
- Smp.* 221e4 τινα POxy 843 B D Schanz Bury Schöne (Hug) Galli : ἄν τινα T P W vulg.: **δὴ τινα** corr. Baiter Burnet Lamb Robin : αὖ τινα Rückert
- Phdr.* 230a4 θηρίον τυγχάνω POxy 1016 B : **θηρίον ὃν τυγχάνω** T W
- Grg.* 504e7 ἢ σιτία PVindob G 39880 + PVindob G 26001 F Iamb. Dodds Díaz de Cerio Díez – Serrano Cantarín : **σιτία** B T W
- Grg.* 504e8 αὐτὸν PVindob G 39880 + PVindob G 26001 F B Iamb. : **αὐτὸ** T W f B² (vel b)
- R.* 414c9 γε POxy 2751 F : **δέ** A D edd.
- R.* 611e3 ἀεὶ ὄντι POxy 3157 D F Slings 2003 : **τῷ ἀεὶ ὄντι** A Chambry Boter

Università di Pisa, Universität Hamburg (UHH)
 Italy, Germany
mariavittoria.curtolo@phd.unipi.it